TOPICS IN MARINE BENTHOS ECOLOGY, R. SARDÀ and J.D. ROS (eds.).

Chemical defense in the seaweed Laurencia obtusa (Hudson) Lamouroux*

INMACULADA GRANADO and PASCUAL CABALLERO¹

Dpto. de Biología. Facuitad Ciencias del Mar. ULPGC. Campus Universitario de Tafira. 35/217 Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Spain.

SUMMARY: The marine red alga Laurencia obtusa is a low preference food for the herbivorous gastropods Littorina striata and Osilinus atratus, when offered in the presence of Enteromorpha ramulosa or Ulva rigida, in laboratory assays using the agar suspension method. Neither nitrogen content nor total and available caloric contents could explain this low preference. L. obtusa produces secondary metabolites that can lower its palatability to herbivores. The low susceptibility to grazing by snails in these species of algae seems to be associated with the presence of these secondary metabolites. Feeding by Osilinus was significantly inhibited by crude extract, non-polar and polar fractions of Laurencia. The polar fraction of L obtusa significantly reduced feeding by both snails. In contrast, obtusol isolated from the non-polar fraction of L. obtusa significantly reduced feeding by both snails. In contrast, obtus as esignificantly diminished grazing by Osilinus but not by Littorina. To test whether extracts and individual terpenes were toxic on non-grazer species, their effects on survival of fish larvae (Sparus aurata) were analyzed. Elatol was the most effective in producing the death of jarvae, while obtusane was not active at the used concentrations.

Key words: gastropods, feeding deterrents. Laurencia, fish larvae, ichthyotoxicity, terpenes,

RESUMEN: DEFENSAS QUÍMICAS DEL ALGA LAURENCIA OBTUSA (HUDSON) LAMOUROUX. – El alga roja Laurencia obtusa es un alimento de baja preferencia para los gasterópodos herbívoros Littorina striata y Osilinus atratus, respecto a otras algas (Enteromorpha ramulosa o Ulva rizida), en experimentos de laboratorio usando el método de suspensión en agar. Ni el contenido en nitrógeno ni el contenido calórico de las algas pueden explicar esta baja preferencia. Laurencia obtusa produce metabolitos secundarios que pueden actuar como defensas químicas. La baja susceptibilidad del alga el pasto de estos gasterópodos parece estar asociada con la presencia de metabolitos secundarios. Cuando las algas verdes preferidas eran recubiertas por el extracto britto o la fracción polar o no polar de Laurencia, la alimentación de Osilinus se veía significativamente inhibida. Sin embargo, la fracción polar no tenía efecto sobre Littorina. Los metabolitos puros (elatol, isoobtusol) aislados de la fracción apolar de L. obtusa reducían significativamente el pasto de los dos gasterópodos. El obtusano disminuía significativamente el pasto de Osilinus mentras que su presencia no afectaba a la actividad de Littorina. Para examinar si los extractos y los terpenos aislados eran activos sobre especies no herbívoras, ensavamos su efecto sobre la supervivencia de larvas de peces (Sparus aurata). El elatol fue el compuesto más efectivo en producir la muerte de las larvas, mientras que el obtusano no mostró actividad a las concentraciones utilizadas.

Palabras claves: gasterópodos, inhibidores de la alimentación. Laurencia. larvas de peces, ictiotoxicidad. terpenos.

INTRODUCTION

The importance of plant secondary metabolites in reducing herbivory in terrestrial communities is welldocumented and generally accepted as one of the most effective means of defense against herbivores (Rosenthal and Janzen, 1979; Coley *et al.*, 1985). The chemical ecology of marine plants has been studied less extensively than that of terrestrial plants, but many secondary compounds that have been isolated from marine algae exhibit strong biological activities (Bakus *et al.*, 1986; Faulkner, 1984, 1986, 1987, 1988, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993; Hay *et al.*, 1987; Hay and Fenical, 1988).

^{*}Received February 25, 1994. Accepted November 7, 1994. To whom all correspondence should be addressed

Several recent papers show that some of the hundreds of bioactive secondary metabolites isolated from seaweeds (Norris and Fenical, 1982) function as effective chemical defenses against a variety of herbivores (Targett *et al.*, 1986: Hay *et al.*, 1987, 1988b, d; Paul, 1987; Paul *et al.*, 1987, 1988. Wylie and Paul, 1988; Van Alstyne and Paul, 1988, 1990, Duffy and Hay, 1990; Paul *et al.*, 1990; Hay, 1991, 1992).

Marine algae of the genus Laurencia are distributed worldwide (Saito, 196⁻, 1969a, b, 1982; Saito and Womersley, 1974), and contain many different kinds of compounds (Erickson. 1983; Martín et al.. 1983). In the Canary Islands the genus is represented by the cosmopolitan species Laurencia obtusa (Hudson) Lamoroux, among others (Gil-Rodriguez and Haroun, 1993). L. obtusa produces a varying array of vastly different compounds. Sesquiterpenoids and nonterpenoid C acetogenins (González et al., 1978; Martín and Darías. 1978: Caccamese et al., 1982; Erickson, 1983; González et al., 1983; Faulkner, 1984; Norte et al., 1989, 1991; Öztunç et al., 1991) have been isolated from L. obtusa collections in different islands of the Canarian Archipelago. The major metabolites obtusane, elatol, isoobtusol, and obtusol (Fig. 1) are present in the Canarian species Laurencia ootusa.



FIG. 1. - Chemical structures of the major halogenated sesquiterpenoids isolated from Laurencia obtusa.

One of the best studied terpenes is elatol: this compound, which was originally reported in *L. elata* from Australia (Sims *et al.*, 1974), has been isolated from *L. obtusa* collections in the Canary Islands (González *et al.*, 1976), Belize (Norris and Fenical

1982), and Jamaica (Brennan *et al.*, 1987), among many other sites. Obtusane, isoobtusol, and obtusol have been only isolated from Canarian species. These sesquiterpenoids have a chamigrene skeleton and similar level of halogenation. Obtusane and obtusol differ by only one hydroxyl group. Obtusol and its isomer isoobtusol differ in the enantiomeric relationship of their carbon skeleta (Martín *et. al.*, 1986). Both compounds differ in the isomerism of the carbons 2. 3 and 6. In obtusol these are S, R and S, respectively. while in isoobtusol are completely contrary (R. S and R, respectively). This last isomerism is maintained in elatol.

The biological activity of these metabolites led to pharmaceutical studies. Elatol has antibacterial (Martín *et al.*, 1986; Caballero and Melián, 1988), and ichthyotoxic properties, and is exceptionally toxic against fertilized sea urchin eggs, and totally inhibited cell division (Norris and Fenical, 1982). Isoobtusol has shown cytotoxic and antimicrobial activities González *et al.*, 1982; Martín *et al.*, 1986). Obtusol is inactive as an antimicrobial agent (Martín *et al.*, 1986; Caballeroand Melián, 1988).

Several biological studies have shown that *Laurencia obtusa* is a poor food for many herbivorous animals. Ogden (1976) showed that herbivorous fishes and the sea urchin *Diadema antillarum* in Caribbean coral reefs significantly avoided feeding on *L. obtusa*. Hay *et al.* (1988b, d), who have focused their studies on the ecological implications of herbivory, have shown the defensive value of elatol against tropical herbivorous fishes and sea urchins both in field and laboratory assays.

In previous studies on feeding preference in single choice experiments we have seen that *L. obtusa* is one of the algal species least consumed by the herbivorous snail *Littorina striata* (Granado and Caballero, 1991).

In this study we examine the feeding deterrent effects of non-polar and polar extracts and pure metabolites from *L. obtusa* against the herbivorous gastropods *Littorina striata* and *Osilinus atratus*. Other authors have reported that nitrogen content (Mattson, 1980) and caloric content (Himmelmann and Carefoot, 1975) could influence food preference of herbivores. To test this possibility in our algae, we analyzed the nitrogen and caloric content of the seaweed used in feeding trials.

In addition to test whether these extracts could possibly affect species other than grazers, we ran toxicity tests by exposing fish larvae (*Sparus aurata*) to the same extracts.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Studied species

The marine red alga Laurencia ontusa and two greens. Enteromorpha ramulosa (Smith) Hooker and Ulva rigida Linneaus, were collected by hand at low tide at Dos Roques beach on the northwestern coast of Gran Canaria. A voucher specimen of L. obtusa has been deposited at the herbarium of the Departamento de Biología Vegetal at the Universidad de La Laguna (TFC Phyc. 5589).

The algae were transported to the laboratory in a cooler. After epiphytes and animals were removed from their surfaces, the fronds were rinsed with distilled water to remove sediment and salt, and oven dried at 60 °C for 48 hours (or to constant weight). Although this treatment can affect volatile or minor metabolites, it seems no to affect the patterns of major secondary metabolites from *L. Obtusa* when compared to dried samples at room temperature and in the dark by thin layer chromatography. Dried plant material was ground through a Wiley mill to a particle size of 0.5 mm in diameter and stored in a desiccator until the start of the trials.

The herbivores used in the chemical feeding deterrent experiments were the gastropods *Littorina striata* King and Broderip, and *Osilinus atratus* Wood. The snails were collected in the upper intertidal zone at San Cristóbal beach, and in the lower intertidal zone at Taliarte, respectively. Once in the laboratory, snails were kept in aquaria, within covered plastic containers. The animals were starved for 24 hours before use.

For the toxicity tests we used the fish larvae. Sparus aurata Linnaeus, grown in aquaculture conditions at the Instituto Canario de Ciencias Marinas.

Extraction and isolation of secondary metabolites

Specimens of *L. obtusa* collected in January 1992, were extracted in a Soxhlet apparatus with acetone. The extract was filtered, and the solvent was evaporated under reduced pressure with a rotary evaporator to give a dark-green viscous mass (5.3% of dry weight). The crude extract was repeatedly partitioned (3 times) between hexane and water (1:1).

The hexane layer was concentrated *in vacuo* (4.7% of dry weight, non-polar fraction). To obtain the polar fraction the aqueous layer was extracted (3 times) with diethyl ether and concentrated to dryness (0.5% of dry weight).

The non-polar fraction dissolved in hexane was divided in equal parts, and each was chromatograp-

hed on thin layer plates (TLC) using ethyl acetatehexane (EtOAc:Hex. 3:7) as the developing system. The compounds were detected either by UV lamp (254 nm) or by spraying with H_2SO_4 -HOAc- H_2O solution followed by heating at 120°C. The areas that exhibited similar profiles were combined to give different fractions in order of increasing polarity. The less polar fraction was rechromatographed on preparative TLC (EtOAc-Hex. 1:19) to yield obtusane. Elatol was obtained after repeated TLC of the third area from the non-polar fraction. Fraction 5 was purified by successive preparative TLC with EtOAC-Hex (1:9) as solvent to give isoobtusol and obtusol.

The four metabolites were compared to previosly purified and identified standards and their properties were identical in all respects with those reported for authentic materials (González *et al.*, 1979; Sims *et al.*, 1974).

Chemical feeding deterrent assays

Food preference studies (Granado and Caballero, 1991) indicated that *Enteromorpha ramulosa* and *Ulva rigida* were highly preferred by periwinkles while *Laurencia obtusa* was rarely eaten.

A feeding choice experiment in which the snails were presented with a choice of two types of food-agar suspensions per Petri dish was run. We used the green algae *Enteromorpha* and *Ulva*, whole *Laurencia*, and residue of the extracted *Laurencia* as possible foods, in combinations of two items (*Enteromorpha* or *Ulva vs.* whole *Laurencia*. *Enteromorpha* vs. *Ulva*, *Enteromorpha* or *Ulva* vs. extracted *Laurencia*, and whole *Laurencia* vs. extracted *Laurencia*, and

Crude extract. non-polar and polar fractions, and isolated terpenes from Laurencia were tested individually in a second set of feeding experiments to determine relative deterrent effects. Fractions were dissolved in diethyl ether at known concentrations and added to dried ground Enteromorpha or Ulva. The extract, nonpolar and polar fractions were added approximately at natural concentrations (5.3%, 4.7% and 0.5% dry. weight of a green alga, respectively), and the pure metabolites at 1% dry weight of a green alga. The solvent was evaporated and the ground alga was suspended in 1.8% agar-seawater. The media was then poured into two opposite compartments of four-way divided Petri dishes. Untreated green algae to be used as a control diet (ether only) were poured into the other two compartments. Rietsma et al. (1982) have reported that preference tests among four different foods per Petri dish gave variable results, consequently, tests were conducted using only two foods per dish with the two opposite compartments being filled with the same food.

To each of these dishes, we introduced two *Osilinus* or four *Littorina*, which were allowed to graze for 30 min in the dark. Each of these tests were replicated at least five times.

Feeding was assessed by counting the number of teeding marks left on the surface of the agar suspension as described in Valiela *et al.* (1979) and Rietsma *et al.* (1982). Marks were easily counted under a dissecting microscope. The number of feeding marks in the two compartments with the same food was expressed as a percentage of the total feeding marks in each dish. These percentage data were arcsine-transformed before analysis (Sokal and Rohlf, 1981: Underwood, 1981; Peterson and Renaud, 1989). All analyses were performed using paired *t*-test with SigmaPlot 4.0 package.

Geiselman (1980) developed the agar suspension method to test the palatability of algae and the occurrence of a chemical factor rather than size or toughness as responsible for the feeding deterrent against the herbivore. We suppose that there is a close relationship between the number of bites left on the surface of the agar suspension and the food actually consumed by the animal, independently of the chemoreceptive mechanisms (smell, taste, etc.) used by the herbivores (see Frazier, 1992, for a discussion about how animals perceive secondary metabolites). In any case, if the animal bites the food-agar suspension before recognizing that it is not palatable, the method would be more conservative.

Similar methods coating palatable algae with crude extracts or secondary metabolites of unpalatable seaweeds have been used in evaluating their feeding deterrent effects toward other herbivores (Geiselman, 1980: Paul and Fenical, 1986: Renaud *et al.*, 1990; Irelan and Horn, 1991; Steinberg and Van Altena, 1992).

Fish larval toxicity assays

The extract, fractions and pure metabolites from *Laurencia obrusa* were tested for fish toxicity by using the larvae of gilthead bream (*Sparus aurata*). We used an adaptation of the method developed by Paul (1985). All experiments were carried out on yolk-sac stages with 1 day old larvae. In the laboratory, these larvae were reared in beakers containing 200 ml of aereated seawater at 18°C and salinity 35%c. Approximately 25 larvae per beaker were used.

Compounds were dissolved in a small amount of ether (100 μ l Et O) and stirred into seawater (200

ml) at known concentrations. Seawater and solvent controls were run simultaneously. Toxicity was defined as death of 100% larvae within 1h (acute toxicity) and 24 hours (Paul, 1985). Serial dilutions were tested until the lowest ED_{100} (lowest concentration for 100% mortality) was determined.

Each of these tests was assayed 2-3 times with at least four replicates.

Nitrogen and caloric contents

The organic nitrogen content of algae was measured in triplicate with a Perkin-Elmer CHN elemental analyzer (model 2400), using acetanilide as the standard.

Total and available caloric values were determined with an IKA-Calorimeter system (model C700T). Available caloric content was defined according to Tenore (1981), and calculated by determining the caloric loss after weak acid hydrolysis (in 1 N HCl for 8h at room temperature). Initial and final weights and absolute caloric content were determined and available calories calculated by difference.

Ash-free dry weight (AFDW) was determined by weight loss after ashing at 500°C for 24 h.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Chemical feeding deterrent assays

Littorina strlata and Osilinus atratus preferred to feed on Enteromorpha ramulosa and Ulva rigida over Laurencia obtusa (Fig. 2). Neither snail showed clear preference for one of the two different green algae assayed (p=0.67 for Littorina and p=0.33 for Osilinus, n=6 trials, paired t-test). When L. obtusa was presented together with the green algae, we only observed 0.3-1% of the total bites in the compartments with the red alga in each Petri dish (p<0.001. for both snails).

The deterrent role of extracted metabolites is shown by the result in which both snails preferred the residue of extracted *Laurencia* over whole *Laurencia* (p=0.0012), when we offered a choice between these two food types (Fig. 2. 5th set of bars). Osilinus was apparently sensitive to some material still present in extracted *Laurencia* when given with *Enteromorpha* (p<0.001). while *Littorina* fed on two food types (p=0.334) (Fig. 2. 4th set of bars). This response was independent of the control used (*Enteromorpha* or *Ulva*).





FIG. 2. – Food preferences of (A) Littorina striate and (B) Osilinus airatus, expressed as a % of total feeding marks. Vertical bars through each histogram show ± 1 SE. Significance values are from the paired-sample t-test. E: Enteromorpha ramillosa: U: Ulva rigida; L: Laurencia obtusa; eL: extracted L. musa.

These results support the hypothesis that the low preference for whole *Laurencia* was due to an extractable factor. However, we think that extracted *Laurencia* had some factor which made it unpalatable for *Osilinus*: this factor may be the structural polysaccharides of the cell wall which contains sulfate (Kloareg and Quatrano, 1988).

Nitrogen content, C/N, and caloric content were not related to teeding preference (Table 1). All three algae have high nitrogen content. although *Laurencia* had the highest, while its C:N ratio was intermediate between *Enteromorpha* and *Ulva*. Total and available caloric contents were lower in the green algae relative to *Laurencia*. These results suggest that for similar high nitrogen content, the food preference is probably determined by another factor.

Crude extract from L. obtusa significantly deterred snail feeding. Grazing by Littorina was reduced by 91%, p=0.0036, and 99% for Osilinus. p<0.001. relative to controls (Fig. 3). The result of the feeding tests using feeding fractions agreed well with the chemical analysis. TLC of extract from Laurencia

TABLE 1. – Chemical composition of the algae used in the food preference experiments.

	Algal composition						
Alga	N (%)	C:N	Total KJ/g	Avail. KJ/g	% Avail. KJ	% AFDW	
Enteromorpha	3.33	8.94	9.83	3.60	36.6	66.6	
Ulva	4.00	8.48	11.61	3.76	32.4	67.5	
Laurencia	4.85	8.62	13.86	5.02	36.2	70.9	
extracted L*	3.61	8.04	9.73	4.06	41.7	52.9	

*:L = Laurencia

revealed the presence of obtusane. elatol, isoobtusol, and obtusol with some other minor metabolites. TLC examination showed that extracts from *Enteromorpha* and *Ulva* did not contain secondary metabolites.



FIG. 3. - The effects of crude extract, non-polar and polar fractions from Laurencia obtusa added to food-agar suspension on feeding by (A) Littorina striata and (B) Osilinus auratus, expressed as a % of total feeding marks, the difference up to 100% is the percentage of the controls. Vertical bars through each histogram show ± 1 SE. Sample size is in parentheses at the base of each histogram. Significance values are from the paired-sample *t*-test.

CHEMICAL DEFENSE IN LAURENCIA OBTUSA 35

Non-polar fractions reduced snail feeding by a significant 95-99% (p=0.0039 and p<0.001 for *Littorina* and *Osilinus*, respectively, Fig. 3). Hexane-soluble fractions contained the major compounds above mentioned.

Polar fractions, which amounted to 0.5% of dry weight algae, inhibited feeding preference by *Osilinus* (p=0.006. paired *t*-test): but did not affect *Littorina* feeding (p=0.906. Fig, 3A). The TLC of the polar fraction showed no presence of the major metabolites from *Laurencia*.

These results agree with the hypothesis that the presence of secondary metabolites plays an important role in the unpalatability of the algae. Thus the presence of obtusane. elatol, isoobtusol, and obtusol seemed to be critical for palatability.

Terpenes determined the palatability of the algae. but the snails responded in different ways to the different compounds (Fig. 4). The presence of elatol at 1%



FIG. 4. – The effects of elatei, isoobtusol, obtusol, and obtusane on feeding by (A) *Littoring situata* and (B) *Osilinus atratus*, expressed as in Fig. 3. Symbols and statistical test are as in Fig. 3.

of the algas dry weight reduced feeding more than 90% in *Littorina* and 99% in *Osilinus* (p<0.001, in both cases). Hay *et al.* (1988a) found that elatol also decreased feeding activity in fish. Isoobtusol, the second more effective metabolite, decreased feeding activity by 89% for *Littorina* (p=0.016) and 99% for *Osilinus* (p=0.001). Obtusol was an effective feeding deterrent towards both herbivorous snails (p=0.012, grazing reduced 81% relative to controls, and p<0.001, grazing reduced 98%, respectively). Obtusane did not inhibit feeding by *Littorina* (p=0.287) and showed lower activity than others metabolites for *Osilinus*, although still high (95%, p=0.002).

Our results support the hypothesis that the content of secondary metabolites, rather than nutrients and caloric contents of aigae, control palatability. The snails avoided Laurencia. which contains very active sesquiterpenes. and selected algae low in secondary metabolites. Steinberg (1985) reported similar results with another herbivorous gastropod, Tegula funebralis. which also rejected algal species with high levels of secondary metabolites (polyphenolic compounds). In another case, Hav et al (1988c) demostrated that the dictyopterenes A and B from the brown seaweed Dictvopteris delicatula deterred feeding by fishes. These studies, involving distant geographic areas and taxonomically diverse algae, herbivores, and secondary metabolites, provide a growing body of evidence that support this hypothesis. In this study, there was no negative correspondence between nitrogen content and secondary metabolites. Also in previous studies nitrogen and/or caloric content were unrelated to food preference (Paine and Vadas, 1969; Vadas: 1977: Nicotri, 1980; Duffy and Hay, 1991; Neighbors and Horn. 1991). We think that the metabolites from L. obtusa of Gran Canaria may function as chemical defenses against herbivory in Canarian waters.

Fish larval toxicity assays

The results of fish larval toxicity assays for 1 hour and 24 hours are shown in Table 2. All of the metabolites tested, except obtusane, were toxic in 24 hours. Elatol was the most toxic to fish larvae. As little as 1.5 ugml⁻¹ produced a 100% mortality of larvae after 24 h. Obtusol had the same effect at 2.5 μ gml⁻¹, and the nonpolar fraction at 0.75 μ gml⁻¹. These results suggest the possibility of additive or synergystic toxic effects when these two compounds are together in the nonpolar fraction. Solvent controls showed no toxic effects for the larvae after 1 h; in the 24 h experiments. solvent controls reduced less than 10% the larvae survivorship with respect to the seawater controls. Polar fraction at 0.5 μ gml⁻¹ produced 100% mortality within 48 hours, while ten times this concentration produced the same effect within 8 h. Obtusane did not show acute toxicity at the greater concentration tested (20 μ gml⁻¹). At this concentration, approximately 38% of larvae died within 24 h. Isoobtusol produced 100% mortality at 20 μ gml⁻¹ within 10 h, whereas its toxic effect became apparent during the first hour with 10% mortality.

	Bioassay ED		
Compounds tested	1 h	24 h	
Non-polar traction	30	0.75	
Obtusane	7.5	<u> </u>	
Elatol Isoobtusol	7.5	1.2	
Obtusol	20	2.5	
Polar fraction			

-: not detected toxicity at tested concentrations.

Compounds with minute structural differences differ in their biological activities. Martín et al. (1986) have proposed that the difference observed in bioactivity among obtusol, isoobtusol and elatol must be related with their enantiomeric relation. They found that isoobtusol presented a remarkable antimicrobial activity on both Gram + and Gram bacteria, but this activity was not observed in the isomer, obtusol. Antimicrobial activity was maintained in elatol. In contrast, in our study, while elatol and obtusol were the most ichthyotoxic compounds, isoobtusol was the least toxic, and obtusane had no toxic effect on fish larvae. Other studies have shown similar results: Hay et al. (1988a) have reported that compounds isolated from different Laurencia species, which have very similar carbon skeletons and levels of halogenation, differed in their deterrent effects against tropical fishes. In contrast. Paul and Fenical (1986) did not find different activity among major terpenoid metabolites produced by Caulerpalean algae in antimicrobial. toxicity and feeding deterrent assays. Consequently, the structure of the compounds do not seem to be useful in predicting antifeeding and toxic properties.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was supported by Grant 117/080390 awarded by Consejería de Educación y Cultura from Gobierno Autónomo de Canarias. I. Granado was funded by a grant "Formación del Personal Investigador" from the Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia. The authors wish to thank the Grupo de Investigación en Acuicultura from Instituto Canario de Ciencias Marinas for allowing us to use their installations, and particularly D. Hipólito Fernández-Palacios Barber for his generous supply of fish larvae. The authors are also grateful to Drs. Manuel Norte and J. Javier Fernández (Centro de Productos Naturales Orgánicos "Antonio González", Universidad de La Laguna) who kindly supplied the purified obtusane which was used as reference in isolating our product. The authors acknowledge the valuable discussions and encouragement from Dr. Ivan Valiela. The authors would like to thank two anonymous reviewers who provided useful criticism and advice.

REFERENCES

- Bakus, G. J., N. M. Targett and B. Schulte. 1986. Chemical ecology of marine organisms: an overview. J. Chem. Ecol., 12:951-987.
- Brennan, M.R., K. L. Erickson, D. A. Minott and K. O. Pascoe, 1987. Chamigrane metabolites from a Jamaican variety of Laurencia obtusa, Phytochem., 26:1053-1057.
- Caballero, P. and F. R. Melián. 1988. Actividades antimicrobianas de compuestos de algas del litoral de la isla de Grant Canaria. Bentos, 6:31-35.
- Caccamese, S., R. Azzolina, E. N. Duesler, I. C. Paul and K. L. Rinehart, Jr. - 1982. Laurencienyne, a new acetylenic cyclic ether from the marine red alga Laurencia obtusa. Tetrahedron Lett., 23:3415-3418.
- Coley, P.D., J. P. Bryant and F. S. Chapin III. 1985. Resource availability and plant antiherbivore defense. *Science*, 230:895-899.
- Duffy, J. E., and M. E. Hay. 1990. Seaweed adaptations to herbivory: Chemical, structural. and morphological defenses are often adjusted to spatial or temporal patterns of attack. *BioScience*, 40:368-375.
- Duffy, J. E., and M. E. Hay. 1991, Food and shelter as determinants of food choice by an herbivorous marine amphipod. *Ecology* 72:1286-1298.
- Erickson, K. L. 1983. Continuents of Laurencia. In: P. J. Scheuer (ed.): Marine Natural Products Chemical and Biological Perspectives Vol. V, pp. 131-257. Academic Press, New York.
 Faulkner, D. J. - 1984. Marine natural products: metabolites of
- Faulkner, D. J. 1984. Marine natural products: metabolites of marine algae and herbivorous marine molluscs. Nat. Prod. Rep., 1:251-280.
- Faulkner, D. J. 1986. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep., 3:1-33.
- Faulkner, D. J. 1987. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep. 4:539-576.
- Faulkner, D. J. 1988. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep., 5:613-663.
 Faulkner, D. J. 1990. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep.,
- 7:269-309. Faulkner, D. J. - 1991. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep.,
- 8:97-147. Faulkner. D. J. - 1992. Marine natural products. Nat. Prod. Rep., 9:323-364.

FaulknerR D. L - 1993. Marine Natural Products. Nat. Prod. Rev. 10:497-539.

- Frazier, J. L. 1992. How animals perceive secondary plant compounds. In: G. A. Rosenthal and M. R. Berenbaum (eds.): Herbivores: Their interactions with secondary plant metabolites, pp. 89-134. Academic Press. San Diego.
- Geiselman, J. A. 1980. Ecology of chemical defenses of algae against the herbivorous snail. Littorina littorea, in the New England rock intertidal community, Ph.D. Dissertation. Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution/Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Woods Hole, Massachusetts. 209 pp.
- Gil-Rodríguez, M. C. and R. Haroun. 1993. The genus Laurencia (Rhodomelaceae. Rhodophyta) in the Canary Islands. Courier Forsch. – Inst. Senckenberg 159:113-117.
- González, A. G., V. Darías and E. Estévez. 1982. Chemotherapeutic activity of polyhalogenated terpenes from Spanish algae. Planta Medica. 44:44-46.
- González, A. G., J. D. Martín, V. S. Martín and M. Norte. 1978. A new polyhalogenated sesquiterpene from Laurencia obtusa. Tetrahedron Lett., 23:2035-2036.
- González, A. G., J.D. Martín, V. S. Martín and M. Norte. 1979. Carbon-13 NMR application to Laurencia polihalogenated sesquiterpenes. Tetrahedron Lett., 23:2719-2722.
- González, A. G., J. Darías. A. Díaz. J. D. Fourneron, J. D. Martín and C. Pérez. - 1976. Evidence for the biogenesis of halogenated chamigrenes from the red alga Laurencia obtusa. Tetrahedron Lett., 35:3051-3054.
- González, A. G., J. D. Martín, M. Norte. R. Pérez. P. Rivera. J. Ruano, M. L. Rodriguez, J. Favos, and A. Peralas. - 1983. X-Ray structure determination of new brominated metabolites isolated from the red seaweed Laurencia obtusa. Tetrahedron Lett., 24:4143-4146.
- Granado, I. and P. Caballero. 1991. Feeding preferences by Littorina striata King and Broderip on different algal species. Sci. Mar., 55:577-581.
- Hay, M. E. 1991. Fish-seaweed interactions on coral reefs: effects of herbivorous fishes and adaptations of their prey. In:P. F. SALE (ed.): The Ecology of Fish on Coral Reefs. pp. 96-124. Academic Press. New York.
- Hay, M. E. 1992. The role of seaweed chemical defenses in the evolution of feeding specialization and in the mediation of com-plex interactions. In: V. J. PAUL (ed.): *Ecological roles of* marine natural products, pp. 93-118. Comstock Publishing Associates, New York.
- Hay, M. E. and W. Fenical. 1988. Marine plant-herbivore interactions: The ecology of chemical defense. Ann. Rev. Ecol. Syst., 19:111-145.
- Hay, M. E., J.E. Duffy and W. Fenical. 1988a. Seaweed chemical defenses: Among-compound and among-herbivore variance. Proc. 6th Internat. Coral Reef Symp., 3:43-48.
- Hay, M. E., W. Fenical and K. Gustafson. 1987. Chemical defense against diverse coral teef marsh herbivores. Ecology. 68:1581-1591.
- Hay, M. E., P. E. Renaud and W. Fenical. 1988b. Large mobile versus small sedentary herbivores and their resistance to seaweed chemical defenses. Oecologia, 75:246-252
- Hay, M. E., J. E. Duffy, W. Fenical and K. Gustafson. 1988c. Chemical defense in the seaweed Dictyopteris delicatula: differential effects against reef fishes and amphipods. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser., 48:185-192. Hay, M. E., V. J. Paul, S. M. Lewis, K. Gustafson, J. Tucker and R.
- N. Trindell. 1988d. Can tropical seaweeds reduce herbivory by growing at night? Diel patterns of growth. nitrogen content. herbivory, and chemical versus morphological defenses. Oecologia, 75:233
- Himmelman, J. H. and T. H. Carefoot. 1975. Seasonal changes in calorific value of three Pacific coast seaweeds, and their significance to some marine invertebrate herbivores. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol., 18:139-151.
- Irelan, C. D. and M. H. Horn. 1991. Effects of macrophyte secondary chemicals on food choice and digestive efficiency of Cebidichthys violaceus (Girard). an herbivorous fish of temperate marine waters. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol., 153:179-194. Kloareg, B., and R.S. Quatrano. – 1988. Structure of the cell walls
- of marine algae and ecophysiological functions of the matrix Polysaccharides, Oceanogr. Mar. Biol. Ann. Rev., 26:259-315. Martín, J. D. and J. Darías. – 1978. Algal sesquiterpenoids. In: P. J.
- SCHEUER (ed.): Marine Natural Products Chemical and Biological Perspectives Vol I. pp. 125-173. Academic Press. New York.

- Martín, J. D., M. Norte, and R. Pérez. 1983. Compuestos no isoprénicos de algas marinas del género Laurencia. Thalassas, 1:67-75.
- Martín, J. D., C. Pérez and J. L. Ravelo. 1986. Enantioselective ring construction: Synthesis of halogenated marine natural spiro[5.5]undecane sesquiterpenes. J. Am. Chem. Soc., 108:7801-7811.
- Mattson Jr., W. J. 1980. Herbivory in relation to plant nitrogen content. Ann. Rev. Ecol. Syst., 11:119-161. Neighbors, M. A. and M.H. Horn. – 1991. Nutritional quality of
- macrophytes eaten and not eaten by two temperate-zone herbivorous fishes: a multivariate comparison. Mar. Biol., 108:471-476.
- Nicotri, M. E., 1980. Factors involved in herbivore food preferen-
- ce. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol., 42:13-26.
 Norris, J. N. and W. Fenical. 1982. Chemical defense in tropical marine algae. In: Rutzler, K. I., McIntyre, I. G. (eds.). The Atlantic Barrier Reef ecosystem at Carrie Bow Cay, Belize 1: structure and communities. *Smithson. Contr. Mar. Sci.*, 12:417-431.
- Norte, M., J. J. Fernández and J. Z. Ruano. 1989. Three new bromo ethers from the red alga Laurencia obtusa. Tetrahedron. 45:5987-599-
- Norte, M., A. G. González, F. Cataldo, M. L. Rodríguez and I. Brito. – 1991. New examples of acyclic and cyclic \tilde{C}_{15} acetogenins from Laurencia pinnatifida, reassignment of the absolute configuration for E and Z pinnatifidienyne. Tetrahedron, 47:9411-9418
- Öztunç, A., S. Imre. H. Wagner. M. Norte. J. J. Fernández and R. González. - 1991. A new haloether from Laurencia possessing a lauroxacyclododecane ring, structural and conformational stu-dies. *Tetrahearon*, 47:2273-2276.
- Ogden, J. C. 1976. Some aspects of herbivore-plant relationship on Caribbean reefs and seagrass beds. Aquat. Bot., 2:103-116.
- Paine, R. T. and R. L. Vadas. 1969. Calorific values of benthic marine algae and their postulated relation to invertebrate tood preference. Mar. Biol., 4:79-86.
- Paul, V. J. 1985. The natural products chemistry and chemical ecology of tropical green algae of the order Caulerpales. Ph.D. Univ. of California. 227 pp.
- Paul, V. J. 1987. Feeding deterrent effects of algal natural products, *Bull. Mar. Sci.*, 41:514-522.
 Paul, V. J. and W. Fenical. 1986. Chemical defense in tropical green
- algae, order Caulerpales. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser., 34:157-169.
- Paul, V. J., C. Wylie and H. Sanger. 1988. Effects of algal chemical defenses toward different coral-reef herbivorous fishes: a preliminary study. Proc. 6th Internat. Coral Reet Symp., 3:73-78
- Paul, V. J., S. G. Nelson and H. R. Sanger. 1990. Feeding preferences of adult and juvenile rabbitfish Siganus argenteus in relation to chemical defenses of tropical seaweeds. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser., 60:23-34
- Paul, V. J., M. E. Hay, J. E. Duffy, W. Fenical and K. Gustafson. - 1987. Chemical defense in the seaweed Ochtodes secundiramea (Rhodophyta): effects of its monoterpenoid components upon diverse coral-reef herbivores. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol., 114:249-260.
- Peterson, C. H. and P. E. Renaud. 1989. Analysis of feeding preference experiments. Oecologia, 80:82-86.
- Renaud, P. E., M. E. Hay and T. M. Schmitt. 1990. Interactions of plant stress and herbivory: intraspecific variation in the susceptibility of a palatable versus an unpalatable seaweed to sea urchin grazing. Oecologia, 82:217-226.
- Rietsma, C. S., I. Valiela and A. Sylvester-Serianni. 1982. Food preferences of dominant salt marsh herbivores and detritivores. Mar. Ecol., 3:179-189.
- Rosenthal, G. A. and D. H. Janzen (eds.). 1979. Herbivores: their interaction with secondary metabolites. Academic Press, New York, 718 pp. Saito, Y. – 196⁻. Studies on Japanese species of Laurencia, with
- special reference to their comparative morphology. Mem. Fac. Fish. Hokkaido Univ., 15:1-81.
- Saito, Y. 1969a. The algal genus Laurencia from the Hawaiian Islands, the Philippine Islands and adjacent areas. Pac. Sci., 23:148-160.
- Saito, Y. 1969b. On morphological distinctions of some species of Pacific North American Laurencia. Phycol., 8:85-90.
- Saito, Y. 1982. Morphology and infrageneric position of three British species of Laurencia (Ceramiales, Rhodophyta), Phycol., 21:299-306.
- Saito, Y. and H. B. S. Womersley. 1974. The southern Australian spècies of Laurencia (Ceramiales: Rhodophyta). Aust. J. Bot., 22:815-874.

2006

- Sims, J. J., G. H. Y. Lin and R. M. Wing. 1974. Marine natural products elatol, a halogenated sesquiterpene alcohol from the red alga Laurencia elata. Tetrahedron Lett., 39:3487-3490.
- Sokal, R. R. and F. J. Rohlf. 1981. Biometry. 2nd ed. W. H. Freeman, San Francisco, California, 859 pp.
- Steinberg, P. D. 1985. Feeding preferences of Tezula funebralis and chemical defenses of marine brown algae. Ecol. Monogr., 55:333-349.
- Steinberg, P. D. and I. Van Altena. 1992. Tolerance of marine invertebrate herbivores to brown algae phlorotannins in temperate Australasia. *Ecol. Monogr.*, 62:189-222.
 Targett, N. M., T. E. Targett, N. H. Vrolijk, J. C. Ogden. - 1986.
- Targett, N. M., T. E. Targett, N. H. Vrolijk, J. C. Ogden. 1986.
 Effect of macrophyte secondary metabolites on teeding preferences of the herbivorous parrotfish Sparisoma radians. Mar. Biol., 92:141-148.
 Tenore, K. R. 1981. Organic nitrogen and caloric content of detri-
- Tenore, K. R. 1981. Organic nitrogen and caloric content of detritus. I. Utilization by the deposit-feeding polychaete. *Capitella capitata*. Est. Coast. Shelf Sci., 12:39-47.

- Uunderwood, A. J. 1981. Techniques or analysis of variance in experimental marine biology and ecology. Oceanogr. Mar. Biol. Ann. Rev., 19:513-605.
- Biol. Ann. Rev., 19:513-605.
 Vadas, R. L. 1977. Preferential feeding: an optimization strategy in sea urchins. Ecol. Monogr., 47:33-371.
 Valiela, I., L. Koumjian, T. Swain, J. M. Teal and J. E. Hobbie. -
- Valiela, I., L. Koumjian, T. Swain, J. M. Teal and J. E. Hobbie. 1979. Cinnamic acid inhibition of detritus feeding. *Nature*, 280:55-57.
- Van Alstyne, K. L. and V. J. Paul. 1988. The role of secondary metabolites in marine ecological interactions. *Proc. 6th Internat. Coral Reef Symp.*, 1:175-186.
 Van Alstyne, K. L. and V. J. Paul-1990. The biogeography of
- Van Alstyne, K. L. and V. J. Paul-1990. The biogeography of polyphenolic compounds in marine macroalgae: temperate brown algal defenses deter feeding by tropical herbivorous fishes. *Oecologia*, 84:158-163.
 Wylie, C. R. and V. J. Paul. – 1988. Feeding preferences of the sur-
- Wylie, C. R. and V. J. Paul. 1988. Feeding preferences of the surgeonfish Zebrasoma flavescens in relation to chemical defenses. of tropical algae. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Sep., 45:23-32.