Didactic audiovisual translation in teacher training

Jennifer Lertola1 · https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4991-8555
Università del Piemonte Orientale
Via Perrone 18, 28100, Novara (Italy)

Noa Talaván · https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5881-5323
Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, UNED
P. Senda del Rey, 7. 28040, Madrid (Spain)

ABSTRACT

Over the last two decades, the active engagement of learners through Audiovisual Translation (AVT) in Foreign Language Learning (FLL) has received increasing attention from both scholars and teachers, and it is now known as didactic AVT. Most AVT modes — subtitling, dubbing, audio description (AD), subtitles for the deaf and the hard of hearing (SDH) and voice-over — can be employed as didactic resources in FLL and guidelines are available for practitioners (Talaván, 2013, 2020). Empirical research has focused on the benefits of didactic AVT on individual and integrated language skills, both in face-to-face and online contexts, English being the main language involved in the pedagogical proposals of most experimental studies (Lertola, 2019).

Recently, a related long-term project, TRADILEX (Audiovisual Translation as a Didactic Resource in Foreign Language Education), led by the TRADIT research group at the UNED, has been funded by the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation for a three-year period. The main aim of TRADILEX is to evaluate the degree of FLL improvement by students in terms of communicative and mediation language skills thanks to the use of didactic AVT. With this purpose, a carefully designed methodological proposal, which includes lesson plans on diverse AVT modes, is being used with learners of English as a Foreign Language (EFL), levels B1 and B2, in non-formal educational contexts, in university language centres all over Spain and in a few centres in other countries, such as England, Italy, and Switzerland.

Teachers play a key role in TRADILEX as they are specifically trained facilitators of the learning process. Many teachers believe that AVT tasks could be integrated in the foreign language curriculum if proper teacher training is provided (as stated by Alonso-Pérez and Sánchez-Requena, 2018). However, it should be noted that teacher training has largely been neglected in the literature (Lertola, 2021). Within this context, this paper presents an online teacher training experience in didactic AVT, carried out by two teacher-researchers as a pilot study of TRADILEX, involving 12 FL secondary-school teachers-in-training at a higher institution in Switzerland. The one-day teacher training aimed to introduce future teachers to the pedagogical use of didactic AVT tasks by presenting and working with both a dubbing and an AD lesson plan targeted for EFL learners of B1 and B2 levels, respectively.

This article analyses and discusses the data gathered through a feedback questionnaire completed by the participants, the assessment of their AVT tasks, and structured as well as non-structured observations. Class observations were collected through two ad hoc observation rubrics (one per AVT lesson plan) filled in by one of the teacher-researchers who carried out the training and the students’ lecturer, who acted as an observer-only teacher, as well as from a group interview and personal notes on the experience shared by the students taking the course. The results of this small-scale study are encouraging and call for further in-depth analysis of the potential role of the didactic AVT in teacher training, both for practitioners and for FL teacher training courses in general.

Keywords: Didactic AVT, dubbing, audio description, TRADILEX, teacher training.

RESUMEN

En las dos últimas décadas, la participación activa de los alumnos en tareas de traducción audiovisual (TAV) didáctica en la enseñanza de lenguas extranjeras (L2) ha recibido una atención creciente por parte de académicos y profesores. La mayoría de las modalidades de TAV -subtitulado, doblaje, audiodescripción (AD), subtítulos para sordos (SpS) y voces solapadas- pueden emplearse como recurso didáctico en este contexto y existen directrices para su aplicación (Talaván, 2013, 2020). La investigación empírica se ha centrado en los beneficios de la TAV didáctica para la mejora de las habilidades lingüísticas individuales e integradas,
tanto en contextos presenciales como en línea, siendo el inglés el idioma principal en las tareas pedagógicas de la mayoría de los estudios experimentales existentes (Lertola, 2019).

Recientemente, un proyecto relacionado, TRADILEX (Traducción Audiovisual como Recurso Didáctico en la Enseñanza de Lenguas Extranjeras), liderado por el grupo de investigación TRADIT de la UNED, ha sido financiado por el Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación de España con una duración de tres años. El objetivo principal de TRADILEX es evaluar el grado de mejora de la L2 en términos de habilidades lingüísticas comunicativas y de mediación, gracias al uso de la TAV didáctica. Con este fin, se está poniendo en práctica una propuesta metodológica escrupulosamente diseñada, que incluye planes de clase sobre diversas modalidades de TAV, con alumnos de inglés como L2, de nivel B1 y B2, en contextos educativos no formales, en centros de idiomas universitarios de toda España y en algunos centros de otros países como Inglaterra, Italia y Suiza.

Los profesores desempeñan un papel fundamental en TRADILEX, ya que son facilitadores específicamente formados en el proceso de aprendizaje. Muchos profesores creen que las tareas de TAV podrían integrarse en el currículo de L2 si se proporciona una formación docente adecuada (según recogen Alonso-Pérez y Sánchez-Requena, 2018). Sin embargo, la formación del profesorado ha sido muy poco tratada en la literatura (Lertola, 2021). En este contexto, este trabajo presenta una experiencia de formación docente en línea sobre TAV didáctica, realizada como estudio piloto de TRADILEX, en la que participaron 12 profesores de secundaria de lenguas extranjeras en formación en una institución de enseñanza superior de Suiza. La formación del profesorado, de un día de duración, tenía como objetivo introducir a los futuros profesores en el uso pedagógico de las tareas de TAV mediante la presentación y el desarrollo de un plan de clase de doblaje y uno de AD, de niveles B1 y B2, respectivamente. En este artículo se analizan y examinan los datos recogidos a través de un cuestionario llenado por los participantes, la evaluación de sus tareas de TAV y observaciones estructuradas y no estructuradas. Las observaciones se recogieron a través de dos rúbricas de observación ad hoc (una para cada plan de clase), llenadas por uno de los dos profesores-investigadores y el profesor del grupo (que hizo las veces de observador), y a través de una entrevista grupal y comentarios individuales escritos por los alumnos del curso. Los resultados de este estudio a pequeña escala son prometedores y apuntan a un análisis más profundo del papel de la TAV didáctica en la formación de profesores, tanto en el caso de los profesionales interesados en utilizarla con sus alumnos como para los cursos de formación de profesores en general.

Palabras clave: TAV didáctica, doblaje, audiodescripción, TRADILEX, formación de profesores.

1. Introduction

The COVID-19 pandemic and ensuing lockdown and quarantine measures have compelled teachers at all levels of education to move to online and blended teaching. Didactic Audiovisual Translation (AVT) is a technology-based active pedagogical resource (as students produce subtitles or dub video extracts, etc.) that can enhance foreign language learning and can be employed as an effective tool in face-to-face, online, and blended contexts (Lertola, 2019; Talaván, 2020; Fernández-Costales, 2021; Baños et al., 2021). Most AVT modes can be used either individually or combined to develop communicative and transferable skills. However, it should be noted that teacher training in didactic AVT has been largely neglected in the literature (Incalcaterra McLoughlin, 2019).

To fill this gap, an exploratory study was carried out with 18 Infant Education EFL students in a Vocational Education and Training (VET) centre in Madrid, Spain (Lertola, 2021). As part of their VET module “Teaching English in Infant Education”, learners were required to develop a free commentary task in which they had to collaboratively write the script for a silent animation and then each record it individually. The free commentary task aimed to foster EFL learners’ writing and speaking skills, as well as giving them the opportunity to develop an infant-targeted digital storytelling activity. Data of the exploratory study, collected through several instruments, support previous research on the benefits of revoicing tasks in language learning and encourage future empirical investigation with in-training primary- and secondary-school, as well as VET contexts.

Language teachers have already called for proper AVT teacher training when surveyed in a recent online questionnaire (Alonso-Pérez and Sánchez-Requena, 2018). As many as 56 teachers of English and Spanish from 15 countries (in Europe, Asia, North and South America), mainly in higher education, answered the online questionnaire. Their answers showed that they taught intermediate-level students (i.e., B1 and B2) in face-to-face environments, using subtitling (79%), dubbing (41%), AD (36%), SDH and voice-over (16%), as well as
free commentary (14%), both interlingually (L1-L2/L2-L1) and intralingually (L2-L2). In line with experimental research, teachers believe that AVT tasks can increase motivation and enhance several learning aspects, namely listening comprehension, vocabulary acquisition and intercultural awareness, as well as oral and written production (Lertola, 2019). Teachers also remarked on some negative aspects such as the time-consuming preparation of AVT tasks, the heavy reliance on Information and Communications Technologies (ICT), and the absence of evaluation guidelines. Most of the teachers surveyed believed that AVT tasks may be effectively integrated in the foreign-language curriculum both in face-to-face and online education if appropriate teacher training is provided.

Besides presenting the possibilities of AVT as a didactic resource in the FL classroom by specifying combination (i.e., interlingual or intralingual), language direction, and learners’ language level, as well as providing a sample task structure for different didactic AVT modes, Talaván (2020) offers sample assessment rubrics for didactic subtitling, SDH, dubbing, voice-over, and AD. These rubrics can be employed either for self-, peer or teacher assessment. With regard to the selection of materials and the time-consuming preparation of AVT tasks, projects such as ClipFlair (Foreign Language Learning Through Interactive Revoicing and Captioning of Clips) and TRADILEX (Audiovisual Translation as a Didactic Resource in Foreign Language Education) can help teachers and independent learners. One of the most important outcomes of the European funded project ClipFlair (2011-2014), based on the previous European project Learning Via Subtitling (LeViS, 2006-2008), was the creation of a single online platform where teachers and learners could find both captioning and revoicing ready-to-use tasks (Zabalbeascoa et al., 2012; Baños & Sokoli, 2015). Unfortunately, the ClipFlair platform is no longer working on all computer systems, as it has fallen victim to the rapid pace of technological development. Therefore, the objectives of TRADILEX include the creation of an online platform where AVT lessons, designed by project members, will be freely available for teachers and learners alike.

This paper will describe the recently funded TRADILEX project, and it will illustrate the key role of teachers in didactic AVT, and how they need to receive specific training in order to be facilitators of the learning process. The paper will also describe an online teacher training experience on didactic AVT carried out as a pilot study of the TRADILEX project that involved 12 FL secondary-school in-training teachers at a higher education institution in Switzerland. The one-day teacher training session introduced participants to the pedagogical use of AVT tasks by working with a dubbing as well as with an AD lesson plan (LP) targeted for EFL B1- and B2-level, respectively. The paper will analyse and discuss the data gathered through a feedback questionnaire completed by the participants, the assessment of their AVT tasks, as well as from structured and non-structured observation techniques.

2. The TRADILEX project

TRADILEX (2020-2023), led by the TRADIT (didactic audiovisual translation) research group at the UNED, funded by the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation, aims to determine the degree of improvement in FLL through the use of didactic AVT, with a particular focus on English. Eleven Spanish and four international higher education institutions are taking part in this project. During its first year and a half of existence, TRADILEX has developed a methodological proposal offering a didactic sequence including the use of diverse didactic AVT modes – subtitling, voice-over, dubbing, audio description, and subtitling for the deaf and the hard of hearing.

---

2 http://clipflair.net/
3 https://tradit.uned.es/en/tradit/
The didactic sequence, specifically designed for the project, contains a total of sixty 60-minute complete lesson plans, six lesson plans per AVT mode and per level (since there is one sequence for English B1 and one for English B2). All lessons contain various reception, mediation, and production activities in the different phases: warm-up (10’), viewing (5-10’), AVT task (30’) and post-AVT task (10-15’). Lesson plans are conceived to be completed online, without the teacher’s assistance, as they contain a key for self-assessment automatically provided by Google Forms once the work is submitted (see example of lesson plan on subtitling - in PDF format for easier visualisation - here: https://cutt.ly/6C3j73l). Once the lesson plan is self-assessed, teachers may download the subtitling or revoicing file to provide personalised feedback regarding the AVT task that lies at the core of each lesson plan.

To assess the validity of the methodological proposal contained in TRADILEX, and after pre-piloting each lesson plan with the support of individual students and experts, two didactic sequences containing 15 lessons (3 per AVT mode) were set up to be carried out online with a set of subjects from language centres at various universities in Spain (one sequence per level-B1 and B2) over a 5-month period. The progression of the didactic sequence is as follows: one lesson plan per week, provided it is used as a complementary pedagogical resource, starting with subtitling, and then voice-over, dubbing, AD and SDH. Each lesson plan makes use of a two-minute video from a film or clip available online (calibrated in terms of proficiency level), but for the actual AVT task only a one-minute video, extracted from the two-minute extract, is used.

At the time the didactic sequences were being designed and tested, a MOOC (Massive Open Online Course) on didactic AVT called TRAVEL was created for teacher training in this area. It was offered by UNED Abierta (https://iedra.uned.es). The MOOC consists of 25 hours and so offers students the possibility of applying for 1 credit (ECTS). The first call for teachers to enrol in this MOOC took place in 2021 and 420 teachers registered for the course; there will be two calls for teachers during 2022. Teachers play a key role in TRADILEX as they are specifically-trained facilitators of the learning process, so the design of this online free training on didactic AVT has been a key element in the successful development of the project.

Finally, a manual of good practices containing the methodological bases of didactic AVT and providing guidelines for researchers and practitioners to apply to each didactic AVT mode will be published during the final phases of the project. Moreover, a user-friendly online web platform, with an integrated subtitle editor and a voice recorder video tool, will be created at the end of the project, with a view to making this pedagogical resource available for students for self-learning, and for teachers who may want to use didactic AVT in their academic program. While the platform is being developed, new lesson plans for different foreign languages (such as Spanish, French, or Italian) will be prepared, following the models used in previous phases of TRADILEX; they are expected to be piloted with small groups of students in the foreign institutions taking part in the project. Ultimately, TRADILEX aims to consolidate didactic AVT as a fruitful and worthy line of research and teaching practice that brings to the fore the use of technology, digital communication, and audiovisual media to enhance FLL from an integrated perspective.

3. The online teacher training experience

Run as a pilot study, the online teacher training on didactic AVT was aimed at future teachers of FL/L2 languages in secondary schools and two lesson plans of the TRADILEX project were piloted. The one-day training was
carried out by the two teacher-researchers from TRADILEX who author the present paper and involved 12 secondary-school teachers-in-training at a higher institution in Switzerland. The lecturer of the in-training teachers also attended as a moderator and observer. In the first one-hour session, one of the two teacher-researchers presented didactic AVT and its main modes divided into captioning (i.e., subtitling, SDH and creative subtitling) and revoicing (i.e., dubbing, creative dubbing, AD, voice-over and free commentary). Sample teaching experiences with revoicing modes were also shown to participants. In the second one-hour session, the other researcher described the TRADILEX project, explaining the project’s didactic AVT sequence and paying particular attention to lesson plan samples of diverse AVT modes to get participants acquainted with the LPs’ structure.

After the two introductory sessions, participants were required to carry out and submit two LPs in two hours, one LP per hour: one on dubbing for English B1-level (LPD1 B1, https://cutt.ly/yTzYXWD) and one on audio description for English B2-level (LPAD1 B2, https://cutt.ly/zTzY1hu). Participants worked on their own and could ask the researchers or their lecturer for linguistic or technical assistance. The original TRADILEX lesson plans were slightly adapted for this teacher training since some participants did not speak Spanish. In particular, one exercise that required knowledge of the Spanish language was deleted and instructions also explained how they could watch the video tutorials in Spanish with auto-translated English subtitles. After submitting the second LP, participants were asked to complete a feedback questionnaire on the online teacher training experience. They were then invited by their lecturer to provide oral feedback on the teacher training by answering some questions and adding further comments over 30 minutes; further written feedback on the teacher training was also sent by the participants to the lecturer the following week. The whole online teacher training was video-recorded for research purposes.

3.1. Data collection instruments

The pilot study data was gathered through a feedback questionnaire filled in by the participants at the end of the online teacher training, together with their completed LPs, which included their dubbing and AD tasks, as well as from their oral and written comments after the experience. The AVT tasks were assessed by two observers using specifically designed rubrics. Furthermore, two complementary instruments, in the form of structured and non-structured observations (Dörnyei, 2007), were collected through two ad hoc observation rubrics (one per LP) filled in by one teacher-researcher and the participants’ lecturer or observer. The structured observations provide quantitative data through a six-point Likert scale that includes seven criteria, whereas the non-structured observations provide qualitative data, collected through open questions (both oral and written).

The feedback questionnaire (https://cutt.ly/MTzYAOG) elicits factual, behavioural and attitudinal data (Dörnyei, 2010). As part of the factual and behavioural data, participants were required to provide their student code, age range, gender and first language, the language(s) they would teach, a brief description of any previous teaching experience, and any English language certificate they might hold (questions 1-6). In addition, participants were asked about any previous exposure to didactic AVT inside and outside the classroom (questions 7-9). The attitudinal data was collected through several items that required participants to provide their feedback on each LP (LPD1 B1, questions 10-17; LPAD1 B2, questions 18-25). The questions for each LP were the same but some of the criteria were changed according to the corresponding AVT mode (i.e., dubbing and AD). There was also a final section about assessment and satisfaction (questions 26-27).
3.1.1. The lesson plans: dubbing and AD

As previously mentioned, each LP designed within the TRADILEX project follows a 60-minute structure in four phases: warm-up (10’), video viewing (5/10’), didactic AVT (30’) and post AVT task (10/15’). The first phase—warm-up—serves to anticipate the content of the video by presenting new vocabulary, syntax, or relevant cultural information. During the second phase—video viewing—, a two-minute video from a short film, available online (that has been carefully selected and calibrated) is watched at least twice (with or without subtitles), while performing some related activities that allow for active viewing. In the third phase—didactic AVT—, learners perform the required AVT task of only one-minute extract from the video using a specific software. The last phase—post AVT task—requires learners to perform related production and/or reception activities to practice relevant elements of the video.

The first lesson plan —LPD1 B1— is based on a short video called “The controller” and it can be accessed here: https://cutt.ly/rAEDTdA. The ten-minute warm-up contains six multiple choice questions that require learners to identify the jargon gamers use, by matching the definitions with the correct word. In the five-minute video viewing phase, learners are required to watch a two-minute video in English (https://youtu.be/4S0qHVeATQk) with English subtitles at least twice, and to note down all the imperative forms they might find. In the 30-minute didactic AVT phase, learners should prepare the dubbing script in English for one character of the video (for only one minute extract from the video: https://youtu.be/ZHVporFABI). In order to dub the character, learners are reminded to make sure the English dialogue is synchronized with the visuals and the character starts and stops speaking at the same time as the one in the video. Furthermore, they are advised to rehearse before recording and to respect the following guidelines for didactic dubbing:

- Lip synchrony. Your recording should be synchronized with the characters’ mouth movements, as if your words came out of their mouths.
- Fluency and speed of speech. Your speech needs to be fluent and fast enough to fit the characters’ mouth movements and delivery of the original.
- Naturalness. To be as natural as possible when you produce your new audio track, focus on using correct pronunciation and intonation in the foreign language. If appropriate, you could exaggerate difficult sounds so as to achieve a greater degree of naturalness.
- Dramatization. Although you are not a professional actor, believe in what you are saying and make your new audio track as realistic as possible.

In addition to didactic guidelines, software recommendations and technical tutorials are also provided. Once the short video is dubbed, learners should save their file and follow precise instructions to include the link to their dubbing file in the LP so that the teacher may download it for assessment and feedback later on. Finally, a post AVT task lasting 15 minutes follows. Here, participants are asked to imagine how the story would continue by writing a short fictional dialogue in the FL between the characters (80-100 words). Several ideas are given to help them write the dialogue. Upon submission of their LP, they can access a complete sample answer key.

The second lesson plan —LPAD1 B2— is based on a silent, animated short film called “Eggs Change” and it can be accessed here: https://cutt.ly/8AES45J. In order to anticipate the video content, the first phase consists of a number of short activities: matching verbs related to ways of looking and moving; providing a tentative translation of some verbs into their mother tongue; reading an English text about AD and answering three true or false questions. In the video viewing phase, learners watch a two-minute video at least twice (https://youtu.be/PmlFv1o8VG4). The first minute of the animated short film is audio described and, during the
first viewing, learners should pay attention to what has already been described and think of what needs to be done in the second minute. During the second viewing, they should pay attention to the verbs of looking and moving they can hear in the description and answer four questions. In the didactic AD phase, learners are asked to write down in English five actions that need to be described in the second part of the video. To this end, they are encouraged to use some of the verbs from the warm-up. They should then produce the English AD script for the second minute of the video (https://youtu.be/YJXqdO21Mt0) and read it aloud, adapting the length of the sentences whenever necessary so that they are synchronized with the images. Learners are advised to use certain software and to rehearse before recording. They are instructed to describe what the audience cannot see in it as briefly and precisely as possible and they are provided with the following guidelines:

- **Lexical accuracy and richness.** Be accurate in your descriptions and look for the most precise words that can recreate the corresponding images in the mind of the audience. Some examples of verbs indicating locomotion are: walk, step, run, turn, linger, stomp, follow, enter, advance, retreat, etc.

- **Grammatical precision and reduction.** Express actions and describe situations using precise syntactic structures; do not provide unnecessary information that may be clear from the original soundtrack, avoid being redundant or anticipating content or actions.

- **Creativity.** Be creative with your intersemiotic translation solutions. To this end, you need to understand the images first, look for accurate and precise words and structures, and visualize the images your descriptions can create in the mind of a person who has no access to the original visual input.

After inserting the link to their AD task in the LP, learners can move on to the post AVT task, which requires them to write a short story in English (100-120 words), based on a traditional fairy tale. Some pointers are given to guide the writing activity. Once the LP has been submitted, learners gain access to a set of sample answer keys of the LP.

The dubbed and audio described tasks were evaluated by the two teacher-researchers, using assessment rubrics from the TRADILEX project based on Talaván (2020). The dubbing rubric evaluates learners’ performance on five criteria that reflect the guidelines provided within the LP, aimed at producing a good result in terms of didactic dubbing (not only foreign language skills), namely: linguistic accuracy (pronunciation and intonation); lip synchrony; fluency and speed of speech (naturalness); technical quality; and dramatization. Each criterion is evaluated on a scale from 0-2: 0-0.5 poor; 0.6-1 adequate; 1.1-1.5 good and 1.6-2 excellent. The final mark is accompanied by individual feedback for each learner. Similarly, the AD rubric assesses learners’ output on five criteria, aimed at assessing a good didactic AD output (not only foreign language skills): synchrony; fluency and speed of speech; lexical accuracy and richness; grammatical precision; and creativity. Each criterion can also score from 0-2 and individual feedback is also provided to learners.

### 4. Data analysis

The subjects enrolled in the teacher training experience comprised a total of 12 in-training teachers, 50% male and 50% female, mainly (66.7%) between 20 and 30 years of age and most participants already had teaching experience. Their native languages were varied – Swiss German (7 subjects), Italian (6), German (4) and French (1) – and so were the languages they taught – German L1 (7), German L2 (3), French L2 (5), Italian L1 (2), Italian L2 (8), English L2 (4). As regards their previous contact with AVT, only two participants said they had received training on AVT, and their use of AVT as a didactic tool both within or outside the FLL context was very scarce, as can be observed in Figures 1 and 2:
After presenting the sample, the data we will go on to describe herein refers to the marks obtained by the participants in the dubbing and AD tasks, the data derived from the observation rubrics, the feedback gathered from the questionnaire and the qualitative interpretation of the final interviews and notes.

4.1. Didactic AVT tasks assessed

The dubbing and AD tasks were assessed by the two teacher-researchers, on a scale from 0 to 10, and the average marks were quite good, as displayed in Figure 3:

While most participants (10 out of 12) submitted their dubbing tasks correctly in the corresponding Google Form, only 7 managed to do so with their AD tasks. The main problem was that they needed to copy the link to their recording in the Google Form and some students did not copy it or share it properly. In the case of the AD task, one reason behind this difference in submission numbers was probably the extra challenge of the task, which was twofold: firstly, in that repeating a script (for dubbing the task was intralingual) is easier than creating a new script from scratch, and secondly, in that the new script requires images to be translated into words (as required for AD).
Despite being the first time that most subjects had faced an activity of this nature and that they had to use specialised video editing software, the results were pretty good: an average of 9.08/10 for dubbing and 9/10 for AD, where the standard deviation was also reasonable in both cases (0.95 and 0.87 respectively), probably slightly better for dubbing because it was B1 instead of B2, and a less challenging task than AD.

The feedback provided to the participants for the dubbing task was quite positive as observed in Figure 4, which presents the different aspects assessed in the rubric and the total marks obtained in each case from 2 (maximum) to 1.

![Figure 4. Results from the assessment of the dubbing rubric.](chart)

From these data, it can be observed that Lip synchrony was the most challenging aspect for most learners. Dramatization received the best marks, followed by Technical quality, which is a relevant result, especially considering that most participants were first-timers. Linguistic accuracy and Fluency and speed of speech also received good marks; this implies that the task was successful because didactic dubbing focuses particularly on accuracy, naturalness, and speed of speech to help develop oral production skills.

In the assessment of the AD task submitted by the students (presented in Figure 5), Lexical accuracy and richness was assessed very positively, Grammatical precision was also very good, the level of Creativity was surprisingly high, Fluency and speed of speech was higher than expected as well, and the excellent level of Synchrony surpassed expectations.
Regarding the completion of the remaining activities of each lesson plan (from the warm-up, the viewing, and the post-AVT sections), it must be noted that all students (even those who did not submit the link correctly) finished all the sections, and observation of the closed questions results, as well as a preliminary assessment of the open questions and exercises, revealed a level of correctness that seemed quite good (in reading, writing, speaking, vocabulary, and mediation). This observation was needed to check that the performance in the lesson plan as a whole (AVT task included) was sufficiently consistent, and the conclusion (though qualitative, since no detailed marking was performed except for the AVT task) was sufficiently positive and in line with the impressions gathered from the assessment of the AVT tasks.

4.2. Structured observations

When it comes to the information compiled during the observation, the analysis was based on the data gathered by the two teacher-observers (one of the teacher-researchers involved in this article and the participants’ lecturer). The feedback was positive for both lesson plans, although there were a few differences between the two lesson plans that may help the reader understand the fact that the AD task may have been more challenging than the dubbing task and probably slightly discouraging for some subjects. Table 1 shows a summary of the results gathered from the teacher-observers’ rubrics as regards how they perceived the students’ involvement on a scale from 1 to 4: disagree (1), somewhat agree (2), agree (3) and strongly agree (4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pay attention</th>
<th>Ask coherent questions</th>
<th>Are aware of the objectives</th>
<th>Actively participate</th>
<th>Seem interested</th>
<th>Submit the activity on time</th>
<th>Use the software correctly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LPD1 B1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPAD1 B2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Observation of participants’ behaviour while working on each lesson plan.

From the data, it can be deduced that both activities were carried out easily and with a positive attitude on the part of the students (also mentioned in the extra comments provided by both observers in the rubrics), but there is a slight difference between dubbing and AD in three of the criteria above. This might be justified because, as already mentioned, didactic AD is a more comprehensive and challenging task, not only because of the extra
effort of translating images into words, but also because students must create their own script almost from scratch. Hence, the cognitive effort is more intense, and this may be slightly discouraging for some first-timers. Yet, for those who take the challenge, the benefits are multiplied, as discussed in the following section.

4.3. Feedback from the questionnaire

The final questionnaire gathered participants’ data about the dubbing and the AD LPs. Figure 6 offers a summary of results regarding the students’ perception of clarity in the two lesson plans, as to task instructions, use of software, software tutorial, and key solutions.

![Figure 6. Clarity of the lesson plans.](image)

These results show, once again, that the AD task (and the lesson plan it formed part of) was perceived as more challenging (it should be remembered that the required level of English was also higher, namely B2 for AD and B1 for dubbing). Although both lesson plans were designed along similar lines, the perception of clarity of LPD1 B1 exceeded that of LPAD1 B2 in most aspects (only software and keys scored higher than AD in this regard). Proof of this can be derived from the perception of clarity in the use of the software tutorial, which was the same tutorial in both cases, but was perceived as less clear for LPAD1 B2.

It is also especially interesting to compare the students’ perceptions of both tasks according to several criteria (i.e., enjoyable, tiring, useful, insightful, thought-provoking, appropriate, informative, and intuitive), since AD received a higher score than dubbing in most criteria, proving that, even if it is more challenging, it also seems to be more rewarding and interesting as a didactic resource. The average marks presented in Table 2 are taken from a scale from 1 to 4: disagree (1), somewhat agree (2), agree (3), and strongly agree (4):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enjoyable</th>
<th>Tiring</th>
<th>Useful</th>
<th>Insightful</th>
<th>Thought-provoking</th>
<th>Appropriate</th>
<th>Informative</th>
<th>Intuitive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dubbing</strong></td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AD</strong></td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>2.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Participants’ perceptions of the two didactic AVT tasks.
Except for ‘tiring’, which is reasonable given the extra challenge of AD, all the other aspects were more highly rated for didactic AD than for didactic dubbing. These results go hand in hand with the students’ perception of improvement in terms of foreign language learning skills, where AD seems to do better overall, as Figure 7 shows, based on a scale from 1 to 4: useless (1), somewhat useful (2), useful (3) and extremely useful (4).

As we can see in this graph, AD is considered more useful than dubbing as far as writing and English skills in general are concerned. Also, while both revoicing AVT modes are perceived as very useful in terms of speaking skills (3.25), it is worth noting how they are also considered as quite useful for reading skills (2.87), probably because of the use of subtitles when watching the videos and the various accompanying activities surrounding the AVT tasks in the LPs. Listening skills are obviously better considered in dubbing than in AD, since the video used for dubbing contained dialogues, while only the first part of the AD video contained a sample AD for students to use as a reference. Finally, ICT (transferable) skills seem to widely benefit in both cases, although slightly less in the case of AD, which may be once again an opinion based on the extra challenge of the task. To sum up, 75% of the participants involved in the study considered dubbing tasks useful to improve foreign language skills, while 83.3% affirmed the same regarding AD tasks, confirming previous data and assumptions included in this paper.

4.4. Non-structured observation: interviews and notes

The qualitative data from the final oral interviews (that contained a single open question on general feedback on the experience) are discussed here together with the data derived from final written notes submitted by each of the participants to their lecturer one week after the teacher training session. Five labels have been created to categorize the opinions of the participants as expressed in the interview and the personal notes: suggestions, pros and cons, challenges, neutral comments, and positive feedback. Figure 8 summarizes the type of data received in this regard:
As shown in the graph, positive feedback was one of the most frequent types of comment found in both the oral interviews and the written notes. Table 3 shows examples of these comments (some of them translated from French and Italian by the authors).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORAL INTERVIEW</th>
<th>WRITTEN NOTES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fun idea [...], quite creative, something different</td>
<td>TRADILEX is a very motivating project for students who want to use it in their computer subject and also very useful for languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once all is explained it is a COOL activity</td>
<td>What I like the most is the innovative nature of the exercises that make use of technical elements that teenagers will adore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is easy to work with these tasks and useful</td>
<td>I find the project very interesting and very ’contemporary’, thanks to its deep integration with media tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fun and very enjoyable result</td>
<td>I found the project really interesting to discover since I’ve gathered a good number of new ideas from it. What I love the most from this project is its varied and modern way of teaching languages. For some students, it’ll definitely be a very motivating method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good idea and good questions</td>
<td>I think I can imagine myself using some of the exercises I’ve learnt from this project within my own future teaching practice so as to reach all types of learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I liked it very much, I am passionate about translation</td>
<td>I liked the project because I really learned a lot of new things and I was able to try out tools that I had never used before. I will certainly treasure the many ideas the project gave me</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great for language learning</td>
<td>At present, I think it’s good that the project covers new media. This way, we can parallely work on learners’ digital media skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although the comments gathered from the interview are very clear and direct, the notes written down by participants include more detailed feedback, where some ideas (underlined) are repeated: modern approach, multimedia, technology, transferable skills, and motivation. It is also worth noting how teachers see themselves using this type of methodology in the future and how they see it suitable for all types of students.
Neutral comments and pros and cons seem less relevant to analyse than positive feedback; yet, it is worth commenting on a few representative samples (specially from the written notes), offered in Table 4:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NEUTRAL COMMENTS</th>
<th>PROS AND CONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For me it is always a good exercise to get out of my comfort zone</td>
<td>Even if I find that the task really motivates students, I can’t help but see an onerous learning effort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A method that is not so well known and therefore brings with it an element of surprise</td>
<td>For instance, I liked the written exercises, but I don’t get on so well with the rest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This way of teaching is quite close to the learners’ everyday life. If learners are familiar with the various tools they are supposed to use, one can concentrate more deeply on the language content</td>
<td>In my opinion it is a nice activity to do before the holidays, but I can’t clearly see the objective of developing language skills in a foreign language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It includes, on the one hand, receptive skills (listening and watching), and on the other the project includes also productive skills (writing and speaking)</td>
<td>Language level is high in these two LPs but it can be adapted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Examples of neutral comments and pros and cons.

The neutral comments are interesting because they confirm and complement previous data: the potential of didactic AVT for integrated skills enhancement, the novelty of the practice that may trigger extra motivation, and how familiar and natural the elements included in these activities (video, technology, translation) are for learners. As to the statements that comment on pros and cons, they should be considered bearing in mind that no practice is equally valid for everybody; following the comments above, we see how it can be motivating but challenging, it may sometimes depend on the learner’s preferences, it may be just valid as something extra (but not that efficient for FLL), it could be considered high level but easily adaptable, etc.

Finally, some of the suggestions mentioned in the interviews and in the notes could be said to open new research and/or training paths, such as the integration of these tasks in a media course. To keep the technical glitches to a minimum, some participants propose that the software be explained in advance or having technical support during the tasks. There is one comment related to adapting this type of activity for beginners (A2 learners) and three participants comment on the need to rework the objectives and certain aspects of this methodology if it is to be used in secondary education (including the language level and the time devoted to the activity). Admittedly not unexpected, the challenges included refer to the difficulty and the time-consuming nature of the tasks, the technological know-how and the high language level required.

5. Discussion

This pilot study analysed the data of an online teacher training experience on didactic AVT, gathered through several instruments. The 12 FL secondary-school in-training teachers in a third-level Swiss institution filled in a feedback questionnaire and submitted two didactic AVT LPs. Structured as well as non-structured observations were collected through two ad hoc observation rubrics, one per AVT task, filled in by the two teacher-researchers and their lecturer, who acted as an observer-only teacher. Participants also provided oral and written feedback on the online teacher training experience to their lecturer through a group interview and personal notes respectively.

The feedback questionnaire reveals that the in-training teachers (6 female and 6 male, most of whom were between 20 and 30) had different native languages (mainly Swiss German and Italian) and taught different L1 and L2 (mainly German L1; French, Italian and English L2). Interestingly, the majority of the participants had
some teaching experience but only two of them had received AVT training, though not in didactic AVT either within or outside educational context.

During the one-day teacher training, participants had to carry out and submit two AVT LPs. Even though all participants submitted the two LPs, not all the AVT tasks were finally included in their submissions: 10 out of 12 participants included their dubbing task, while only 7 out of 12 included their AD task. In order to include their dubbing or AD task in the LP to be submitted, participants had to copy the link of their recorded task in the Google Form of each lesson plan but some of them did not copy it correctly or did not share it properly. The greater dropout in the AD task submission could also be ascribed to the fact that participants found AD a more challenging exercise due to the need to write a complete script, in which the images should be translated into words, compared to intralingual dubbing which is a repetition of the original spoken text.

The dubbing and AD tasks were then evaluated by the two teacher-researchers and, considering that this was the first time that the participants had been exposed to dubbing and AD, the marks were very positive: an average of 9.08/10 for dubbing and 9/10 for AD. The slight difference in favour of the dubbing task could be due to the fact that the dubbing lesson plan was targeted for B1 level whereas the AD was designed for B2 level. Having said that, the participants’ performance in AD was particularly good with regard to Lexical accuracy and richness, Synchrony, and Fluency and speed of speech.

As acknowledged in the final questionnaire, despite perceiving the AD task as more challenging than the dubbing task, participants seemed to appreciate AD more and evaluated it more positively according to criteria such as enjoyable, useful, insightful, thought-provoking, appropriate, informative, and intuitive. These evaluations are in line with their perceptions of improvement in FLL skills, where they judged AD as more effective for the development of general competences in English and writing, followed by speaking and reading (where it scored the same as dubbing). Unsurprisingly, listening skills were appreciated more in dubbing than in AD, since the AD video had no dialogue. Benefits in ICT skills are perceived to be significant in both AVT modes, although slightly more so in the case of dubbing. Finally, the participants’ preference for didactic AD is confirmed by the fact that 83.3% of them consider AD tasks useful to improve foreign language skills, while 75% would say the same in the case of dubbing.

After submitting the two LPs and the final questionnaire, one of the two teacher-researchers and the participants’ lecturer filled in an ad hoc observation rubric for each lesson plan, articulated around seven criteria, measured on a six-point Likert scale, and an open-ended question. Observations confirm that participants found the AD task more challenging than the dubbing task, but they also corroborate that the two didactic AVT tasks were performed adequately and with a proactive attitude.

Further oral and written feedback about the whole experience was gathered from the participants in the form of non-structured observation through a final oral interview at the end of the training and notes submitted to the lecturer one week after the training. In the interview, their lecturer asked a single open question to get general feedback. To categorize the interventions of the participants in the interview and the notes, five labels were employed: positive feedback, neutral comments, challenges, pros and cons, and suggestions. The feedback obtained is positive, especially in the reflective notes, where the comments are more detailed than in the interview. While participants made use of the written notes to discuss some pros and cons, the final interview gave them the opportunity to raise some suggestions and challenges. For most participants, didactic AVT is a modern and motivating approach to the teaching of foreign languages that makes use of multimedia and technology that, in turn, aids the development of transferable skills. Furthermore, the in-training teachers
acknowledged they would be willing to use didactic AVT in their future career as they considered it suitable for teaching any age group.

To conclude, the data collected through the different instruments seem to point to the same idea: that both dubbing and AD tasks are useful for language learning, with a slight preference for AD. This is the case even though the AD task, and its lesson plan, were considered to be more challenging than the dubbing task. As already discussed, this could be due to the more demanding nature of the intersemiotic transfer (i.e., from images into English as an L2) required in AD, when compared to the intralingual transfer (from English into English) taking place in dubbing, and to the higher English level of the lesson plan (B2 vs. B1).

6. Conclusion

This paper has reported on an online teacher training experience on didactic AVT, carried out as a pilot study of the TRADILEX project. It involved 12 foreign language secondary-school in-training teachers at a higher institution in Switzerland. The one-day training introduced participants to didactic AVT and required them to carry out a dubbing and an AD lesson plan designed for B1-and-B2 level EFL learners respectively. Qualitative and quantitative data, gathered through various data collection instruments, clearly reveal that participants found both tasks useful to improve foreign language skills. Despite finding the AD task more demanding, participants preferred AD to dubbing. All in all, they found didactic AVT a modern and motivating approach that they intend to use in their future teaching career as it can be exploited with any type of learner.

Participants’ perception of didactic AVT as an effective tool for developing integrated language skills is in line with previous research (Lertola, 2019; Talaván, 2020). However, as only two revoicing AVT modes were employed, i.e. dubbing and AD, further research in teacher training should include other revoicing modes, such as voice-over and free commentary, as well as captioning modes, namely subtitling and SDH. It would also be beneficial to use LPs of the same level of proficiency to better compare the participants’ results and opinions. A teacher training experience of this nature has the potential to become a solid starting point in the systematic application of didactic AVT in the training of future teachers.

Declaration of conflicting interests

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding


About the authors

Jennifer Lertola, PhD, is English Junior Assistant Professor at the University of Eastern Piedmont, Italy. Her main research interests include Didactic Audiovisual Translation, English for Specific Purposes (ESP) and English-medium
instruction (EMI). She is the author of *Audiovisual Translation in the Foreign Language Classroom: Applications in the Teaching of English and Other Foreign Languages* (Research-publishing.net, 2019). Furthermore, she has participated in several international research projects, including ClipFlair (Foreign Language Learning through Interactive Revoicing and Captioning of Clips) funded by the European Lifelong Learning Programme. She is part of the ARENA (Accessibility, Audiovisual Translation and Language Learning) teaching innovation group and is a member of the TRADIT (Didactic Audiovisual Translation) research group at the Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED), Spain. TRADIT is currently developing the TRADILEX (Audiovisual Translation as a Didactic Resource in Foreign Language Education) project.

Noa Talaván obtained her PhD in 2009 with a thesis on the didactic applications of audiovisual translation to foreign language education. Since then, this has been her main research interest, a field where she has contributed with almost 40 peer-reviewed publications, including articles in specialised journals, book chapters, and monographs as well as co-editing a specialized issue. She is an Associate Professor of English Studies and Translation in the Foreign Languages Department of the Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED), Spain, and has coordinated 15 teaching innovation projects since 2008 in the area of the didactic applications of audiovisual translation to foreign language education. Currently, she is the coordinator of the research group TRADIT (Didactic Audiovisual Translation) and of the teaching innovation research group ARENA (Accessibility, Audiovisual Translation and Language Learning), both based at the UNED.

**References**


